

Scrutiny (Audit and Value for Money Council Services) Committee

Scrutiny Review: Member Representation on Outside Bodies

Lead Officer: Chris Ebberley

Sub Group: Councillor Deneice Florence-Jukes
Councillor Helen Hall

1. Background:

- 1.1. It was recommended from a previous Internal Audit Review of Representation on Outside Bodies that as a measure of transparency and for good practice, these reports should be presented to one of the Council's Scrutiny Committees. For the past several years, this has been the Value for Money Scrutiny Committee, and more recently the Scrutiny (Audit and Value for Money Council Services) Committee.
- 1.2. It has been several years since the last review of Representation on Outside Bodies and as such the Scrutiny (Audit and Value for Money Council Services) Committee decided to review the current arrangements.
- 1.3. On more than one occasion, Members of the Scrutiny Committee identified that they did not understand the purpose of some of the outside bodies or indeed why they attended them.
- 1.4. Initially, at the request of the Committee, the Corporate and Commercial Manager was tasked with reviewing the number of responses received for the calendar year 2017.
- 1.5. As the review progressed, the Scrutiny Committee agreed that a sub group should meet to finalise the review.

2. Introduction:

- 2.1. Elected Members of East Staffordshire Borough Council can be appointed to sit on and liaise with outside bodies. These, in the main, tend to be charitable

and / or community organisations who support the Council’s work – usually through the priorities of the Corporate Plan. As of September 2018, there are 22 outside bodies in total. The full list of Outside Bodies can be found at Appendix 1.

2.2. At the beginning of each calendar year, Members who are appointed to sit on outside bodies are requested by the Democratic Services Team to complete a report which sets out the number of meetings that have taken place and how many these they have attended. The report also asks for any reasons for non-attendance where applicable along with details of how the activities of the group link into the three Priority themes of the Council and provide details of any upcoming decisions which would impact on East Staffordshire Borough Council.

3. Analysis of Findings 2018

3.1. In February 2018, all Elected Members who serve on an Outside Body were requested to complete a feedback report as above.

3.2. By 2018 there were 22 Outside Bodies served by Members of the Council. Some Bodies are represented by more than Member.

3.3. There were 5 Bodies where no report had been received:

- Staffordshire County Council Health Scrutiny Committee¹
- Queens’ Hospital Governors’ Board²
- Staffordshire and Stoke on Trent Planning Forum
- Staffordshire Police and Crime Panel
- Rolleston Alms Houses - Nominated Trustee

3.4. There were 39 “appointments” in total across the 22 Outside Bodies. This included 5 substitute appointments whereby one Member represents the Council if the appointed Member to that Body is unavailable. In addition, Staffordshire County Council Health Scrutiny Committee and Queens’ Hospital Governors’ Board both receive regular reports received at Scrutiny EGCH Committee from the nominated representative. Therefore the true number of appointments was 32.

3.5. Reports were received from 25 appointments. This represents a 78% response rate.

3.6. There were zero (0) reports received across 7 appointments – from 6 Elected Members. These are identified in Table 1.

Table 1 – Outside Bodies were no reports received

Councillor	Outside Bodies 2017	
Councillor E W R Barker	Staffordshire and Stoke on Trent Planning Forum	

¹ Regular reports received at Scrutiny EGCH Committee from Chairman

² Regular reports received at Scrutiny EGCH Committee from Rep.

Councillor	Outside Bodies 2017	
Councillor Mrs B Toon	Consolidated Charity of Burton upon Trent	Rolleston Alms Houses - Nominated Trustee
Councillor S Gaskin	Staffordshire Police and Crime Panel ³	
Councillor R A Johnston	Carver Road Community Centre Management Committee ⁴	
Councillor S Andjelkovic	Sexual Abuse and Rape Advice Centre (SARAC)	
Councillor S A Hussain	Queen Street Community Centre Management Committee	

3.7. There were zero (0) reports received at all from 4 Elected Members:

- Councillor Mrs B Toon
- Councillor S Andjelkovic
- Councillor S A Hussain
- Councillor R A Johnston

3.8. The table below identifies the attendance rates for the Outside Bodies, taken from information provided by Elected Members.

3.9. As can be seen, a little over half (52.2%) of Elected Members attended all of the possible meetings for their respective Outside Bodies.

3.10. In terms of non-attendance, where the percentage of meetings attended is below 70%, the main reasons cited in the reports are illness; conflicting with other engagements; and holidays.

3.11. There are a number of nuances across the data, particularly amongst Outside Bodies where the Council has more than one representative. This is particularly apparent with the Consolidated Charity of Burton upon Trent – whereby 2 Members have reported a total of 4 possible meetings and another has reported 26.

3.12. There is a similar occurrence with the Carver Road Community Centre Management Committee with 6 and 2 possible meetings being reported. This type of reporting also occurs with the East Staffordshire Sports Council, Uttoxeter Leisure and Development Company Limited and Uttoxeter Heath Community Centre Management Committee Outside Bodies.

3.13. There were also two Outside Bodies where Members have reported that they have not been invited to attend meetings (Carver Road Community Centre Management Committee and Burton Amateur Boxing Club).

3.14. A summary of the findings can be found at Table 2.

³ Councillor S Gaskin replaced Councillor D Florence-Jukes in Feb 2018 following resignation from the Conservative Group

⁴ Councillor R A Johnston replaced Councillor D Florence-Jukes in Feb 2018 following resignation from the Conservative Group

DRAFT

Table 2 – Outside Bodies Attendance 2017

NAME	REPRESENTATIVES	NO. POSSIBLE MEETINGS	NO. MEETINGS ATTENDED	% MEETINGS ATTENDED
Birmingham and Greater Solihull Local Enterprise Partnership	Councillor Mrs P L Ackroyd	4	4	100.00%
	Councillor Mrs P L Ackroyd	4	4	100.00%
Birmingham and Greater Solihull LEP Joint Scrutiny Committee	Councillor Mrs S McKiernan	3	3	100.00%
Consolidated Charity of Burton upon Trent	Councillor L G Milner	4	4	100.00%
	Councillor D F Fletcher	4	3	75.00%
	Councillor D C Leese	26	24	92.31%
	Councillor S Gaskin	Unclear	Unclear	
East Staffordshire Sports Council	Councillor D C Leese	10	2	20.00%
	Councillor E W R Barker / Councillor P Hudson	8	8	100.00%
Joint Waste Management Board	Councillor D C Leese	4	4	100.00%
Public Services LSP Board	Councillor R G W Grosvenor	1	1	100.00%
Uttoxeter Leisure and Development Company Limited	Councillor C Smith	2	2	100.00%
	Councillor Mrs S McGarry	3	3	100.00%
C.P.R.E. (Staffordshire Branch) - Campaign to Protect Rural England	Councillor E W R Barker	4	3	75.00%
Nottingham East Midlands Airport Consultative Group	Councillor C Smith	5	3	60.00%
Sexual Abuse and Rape Advice Centre (SARAC)	Councillor Mrs P L Ackroyd	12	11	91.67%
Burton Amateur Boxing Club	Councillor S Gaskin	5	Not invited to attend any meetings	
Carver Road Community Centre Management Committee	Councillor K J Bulth	6	4	66.67%
	Councillor L G Milner	2	0	0.00%

NAME	REPRESENTATIVES	NO. POSSIBLE MEETINGS	NO. MEETINGS ATTENDED	% MEETINGS ATTENDED
Queen Street Community Centre Management Committee	Councillor A A Chaudhry	9	5	55.56%
Uttoxeter Heath Community Centre Management Committee	Councillor Mrs S McGarry	5	4	80.00%
	Councillor P Hudson	3	Not invited to attend any meetings	
Waterside Community Centre Management Committee	Councillor Ms A J Legg Temporarily replaced by Councillor C Wileman	4	4	100.00%
Henry Warford Trust	Councillor J Jones	2	2	100.00%
Barton and Dunstall Key Trust	Councillor J Jones	3	3	100.00%
Average		5.54	4.59	83.00%

4. Outside Bodies Survey

- 4.1 At the request of the Committee, a survey was sent to all Members who sit on Outside Bodies to ascertain their views on the relevance and usefulness of the organisation to the work of the Council.
- 4.2 The survey was available from the 17th December 2018 with an original deadline of 4th Jan 2019. This was extended to the 14th January 2019.
- 4.3 14 responses i.e. 14 Representatives were received to the survey relating to related to 10 outside bodies. 9 Members identified themselves and 2 responded anonymously.
- 4.4 Outside bodies referenced included:
- Barton and Dunstall Key Trust
 - Birmingham and Greater Solihull LEP Joint Scrutiny Committee
 - Birmingham and Greater Solihull Local Enterprise Partnership
 - Carver Road Community Centre Management Committee
 - Consolidated Charity of Burton upon Trent
 - East Staffordshire Sports Council
 - Henry Warford Trust
 - Rolleston Alms Houses - Nominated Trustee
 - Uttoxeter Leisure and Development Company Limited
 - Waterside Community Centre Management Committee
- 4.5 No responses were received relating to the following 12 Outside Bodies (and appointed Cllr representatives):
- i. Staffordshire County Council Health Scrutiny Committee
 - ii. Joint Waste Management Board
 - iii. Queens' Hospital Governors' Board
 - iv. Staffordshire and Stoke on Trent Planning Forum
 - v. Uttoxeter Leisure and Development Company Limited
 - vi. Staffordshire Police and Crime Panel
 - vii. C.P.R.E. (Staffordshire Branch) - Campaign to Protect Rural England
 - viii. Nottingham East Midlands Airport Consultative Group
 - ix. Sexual Abuse and Rape Advice Centre (SARAC)
 - x. Burton Amateur Boxing Club
 - xi. Queen Street Community Centre Management Committee
 - xii. Uttoxeter Heath Community Centre Management Committee
- 4.6 Members who responded were asked as to whether we should continue to have representation on those outside bodies. The responses are summarised below.

Barton and Dunstall Key Trust

Remove - but one nominated trustee needs to be a Needwood Ward Borough Councillor (as stated in the Trust Deed)

Birmingham and Greater Solihull LEP Joint Scrutiny Committee /

Birmingham and Greater Solihull Local Enterprise Partnership

Remain – “Strategic link with Council”

Carver Road Community Centre Management Committee

Remain – “We own the building”

Consolidated Charity of Burton upon Trent

Remain – “Important to be kept aware of work of voluntary sector”

East Staffordshire Sports Council

Remain – “The sports council distributes ESBC's money so we should have a say in how it is done”

Henry Warford Trust

Remove – “No support from ESBC for this local Charity”

Rolleston Alms Houses

Remain – “It is particularly important for the ward member to be represented on this outside body”

Uttoxeter Leisure and Development Company Limited

Remain – “A Council presence on this outside body helps in partnership working”

Waterside Community Centre Management Committee

Remain – “It is a council building”

5. Feedback from the Outside Bodies

- 5.1. The Committee requested that we write to all outside bodies seeking their views.
- 5.2. Emails and letters were sent to the outside bodies on the 16th April 2019.
- 5.3. Responses were received from 13 of the 22 organisations.
- 5.4. The results of the survey can be found at Appendix 4.

6. Committee Sub Group

- 6.1. At the Scrutiny (Audit and Value for Money Council Services) Committee meeting on the 25th March, Councillors Deneice Florence-Jukes and Helen Hall agreed to meet with the lead officer to form a sub group to consider the views of the outside bodies and to complete the review.

6.2. The sub group met on the 30th May and gave consideration to which organisations should be kept on the list of outside bodies.

6.3. A category approach was suggested to assess which outside bodies should be retained. The categories suggested included:

1. Financial Link to ESBC e.g. *where we award funding / we own building*
2. Strategic Link to ESBC e.g. *GBSLEP*
3. Organisation is Ward specific
4. Community Focus
5. None of the above *Therefore removed from list*

6.4. The sub group considered the outside bodies and assigned them to the various categories. Table 3 illustrates which categories the outside bodies fall within.

6.5. The sub group also reviewed the number of representatives on each outside body. These are denoted in brackets in Table 3. As can be seen, the majority of outside bodies (n15) have 1 representative. Consideration was given as to whether all outside bodies should have 1 representative.

Table 3 - Suggested Category Approach for Outside Bodies

1	2	3	4	5
Organisations with a Financial Link to ESBC	Organisations with a Strategic Link to ESBC	Organisations with a Ward specific focus	Organisations with a community focus	None of the above
East Staffordshire Sports Council (3)	Birmingham and Greater Solihull Local Enterprise Partnership - LEP Board (1)	Rolleston Alms Houses - Nominated Trustee (1)	Consolidated Charity of Burton upon Trent ⁵ (5)	Nottingham East Midlands Airport Consultative Group (1)
Burton Amateur Boxing Club (1)	Birmingham and Greater Solihull Local Enterprise Partnership - Supervisory Board (1)	Henry Warford Trust (1)	C.P.R.E. (Staffordshire Branch) - Campaign to Protect Rural England (1)	
Carver Road Community Centre Management Committee (3)	Birmingham and Greater Solihull LEP Joint Scrutiny Committee (1)	Barton and Dunstall Key Trust (1) ⁶	Sexual Abuse and Rape Advice Centre (SARAC) (1)	
Queen Street Community Centre Management Committee (3)	Staffordshire County Council Health Scrutiny Committee (1)			

⁵ Constitution states 5 Cllrs to be a trustee, however if we deem to reduce the number of Council reps they would be able to amend their Constitution accordingly.

⁶ One nominated trustee needs to be a Needwood Ward Borough Councillor (as stated in the Trust Deed)

1	2	3	4	5
Organisations with a Financial Link to ESBC	Organisations with a Strategic Link to ESBC	Organisations with a Ward specific focus	Organisations with a community focus	None of the above
Uttoxeter Heath Community Centre Management Committee (2)	Joint Waste Management Board (1)			
Waterside Community Centre Management Committee (2)	Queens' Hospital Governors' Board (1)			
	Staffordshire and Stoke on Trent Planning Forum (1)			
	Staffordshire Police and Crime Panel (1)			
	Uttoxeter Leisure and Development Company Limited (2)			

7. Recommendations

The Committee recommends the following:

7.1. That organisations that fall within categories 3, 4 and 5 (Ward Specific, Community Focus, None of the above) are removed from the list of outside bodies associated with East Staffordshire Borough Council.

Therefore a reduction of 22 to 15, losing the following organisations from the list of outside bodies:

- Consolidated Charity of Burton
- CPRE
- Nottingham East Midlands Airport Consultative Group
- Rolleston Alms Houses
- SARAC
- Barton and Dunstall Key Trust
- Henry Warford Trust

7.2. That it be left to the individual Ward Elected Member(s) to decide whether they wish to attend outside groups.

7.3. To reduce the number of representatives to 1 Elected Member per outside body⁷.

7.4. To write to all remaining bodies and request that they update all records to include latest representatives and also copy Democratic Services in all correspondence.

⁷ This would require constitutions being amended in certain cases.

Appendix 1 – List of Outside Bodies as at September 2018.

1. Birmingham and Greater Solihull Local Enterprise Partnership
2. Birmingham and Greater Solihull LEP Joint Scrutiny Committee
3. Consolidated Charity of Burton upon Trent
4. Staffordshire County Council Health Scrutiny Committee
5. East Staffordshire Sports Council
6. Joint Waste Management Board
7. Queens' Hospital Governors' Board
8. Public Services LSP Board
9. Staffordshire and Stoke on Trent Planning Forum
10. Uttoxeter Leisure and Development Company Limited
11. Staffordshire Police and Crime Panel
12. C.P.R.E. (Staffordshire Branch) - Campaign to Protect Rural England
13. Nottingham East Midlands Airport Consultative Group
14. Sexual Abuse and Rape Advice Centre (SARAC)
15. Burton Amateur Boxing Club
16. Carver Road Community Centre Management Committee
17. Queen Street Community Centre Management Committee
18. Uttoxeter Heath Community Centre Management Committee
19. Waterside Community Centre Management Committee
20. Rolleston Alms Houses - Nominated Trustee
21. Henry Warford Trust
22. Barton and Dunstall Key Trust

DRAFT

DRAFT

Appendix 4 – Responses from Outside Bodies

DRAFT